## RECEIVED

DEC 27 2013

Tim Flynn Mayor

VENTURA COUNTY GRAND JURY



## Office of the Mayor

300 West Third Street Oxnard, California 93030 (805) 385-7430 Fax (805) 385-7595 www.ci.oxnard.ca.us

December 23, 2013

Foreman, Grand Jury 800 S. Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

Subject: Grand Jury Final Report Fueling Responsibly in Ventura County

Dear Foreman, Ventura County Grand Jury:

On June 27, 2013, the Ventura County Grand Jury completed a Final Report on "Fueling Responsibly in Ventura County". As part of their findings, the Grand Jury made recommendations which included that Oxnard implement Best Practices to safeguard and monitor usage of fuel for efficiency. This should include interaction with Simi Valley, Thousand Oaks, Ventura and the County of Ventura, who meet periodically to share information regarding Best Practices for cost savings, security, efficiency and theft prevention.

The Ventura County Grand Jury made the following recommendations that are applicable to the City of Oxnard's Fleet Services Division:

- **R-01.** The Grand Jury recommends that Oxnard implement policies that incorporate Best Practices to manage, safeguard and monitor efficient fuel usage. (FI-05-08)
- **R-02.** The Grand Jury recommends that Oxnard, Simi, Thousand Oaks, Ventura and the County meet periodically to share information regarding Best Practices, including cost savings, security, efficiency and theft prevention. (FI-01)
- **R-04.** The Grand Jury recommends that Oxnard, Simi, Thousand Oaks, Ventura and the County review their respective vehicles for instances of underperforming vehicle mileage. Then they should consider reassigning the vehicles to more efficient usage. (FI-07-08)

## Response

**R-01.** The City of Oxnard Fleet Services Division is committed to providing the best services possible throughout all its levels of responsibilities. Fleet Services utilizes internal reporting capabilities in addition to the capabilities provided by Shell. Fleet Services is also in communication with its peers. Therefore, the City of Oxnard feels it does follow Best Practices for controlling and administering its fuel programs. As a practice of metrics and measurements,

Letter to Grand Jury RE: Fueling Responsibility in Ventura County December 23, 2013 Page 2

we will continue to review our methods and refine them as necessary. Please refer to our response to FI-05 and FI-08 below.

R-02. The City of Oxnard does and will continue to meet regularly, as was expressed in the response to FI-01 below.

**R-04.** Every quarter, the City of Oxnard's Fleet Services Manager reviews a vehicle utilization (low mileage) report generated by is vehicle management software. Recommendations for reassignment or survey are made at that time. Please refer to our response to **FI-07** and **FI-08** below.

Additionally, we have responded to each of the findings of the Ventura County Grand Jury. The answers to each lend weight and understanding to our responses to the recommendations above:

**FI-01.** The Grand Jury found that Simi, Thousand Oaks, Ventura and the County use Best Practices when dispensing fuel to municipal vehicles. These municipalities periodically meet and share information regarding efficient administration of fuel operations. (FA-01-05)

The City of Oxnard's Fleet Services Division has been a member of a local Fleet Administrators Association known as the Gold Coast Professional Fleet Association for at least 7 years. This association's core group members consists of; City of Oxnard, City of Ventura, County of Ventura, City of Santa Barbara and County of Santa Barbara. The City of Lompoc and City of Camarillo are also members. This group meets formally four times a year and at least three times a year informally. Topics usually discussed include; fuel, alternative vehicles, vehicle acquisition and disposal, vehicle management software, repair technology, and car pooling. A formal meeting usually will include a guest who's topic will be industry related. AssetWorks Fleet Focus is the vehicle management software used by the core members of Gold Coast Professional Fleet Association.

**FI-05.** Oxnard does not follow Best Practices relative to the limited administration and monitoring of their fuel program, including minimal implementation and use of Shell report capabilities. (FA-10-13)

The City of Oxnard's Fleet Services Division reviews the billing information provided by Shell for accuracy. Vehicle information gathered by the use of Shell's card service is then forwarded to the liaison assigned by divisions and departments for vehicles in their use. These liaisons are responsible for reviewing card usage and reporting any inaccuracies to Fleet Services.

The information gathered by the use of the cards is utilized by Fleet Services once it's uploaded into its vehicle management software for its internal reporting. Fleet Services utilizes the same vehicle management software (AssetWorks Fleet Focus) to generate the same reports utilized by its governmental peers. Examples of which are; mpg, cost per mile, vehicle utilization and the scheduling of preventive maintenance.

Letter to Grand Jury RE: Fueling Responsibility in Ventura County December 23, 2013 Page 3

Additionally, the City of Oxnard utilizes Shell's card fraud division for tracking abnormal and out of town fuel usage. We are also set to add a pin number to the card in the second quarter of 2014 to add another layer of security to our fuel purchases. We will continue to review our methods and refine them as necessary. The vehicles fuel tank capacities have been added to the vehicles profile with Shell. Each Shell card, which is assigned to an individual and not a vehicle, has a "gallons per day" and a "number of transactions per day" limit assigned to it. These cards are also limited to the types of fuel that can be dispensed.

While all of the report functions are not used in Shell's reporting, this information is being analyzed. Shell's reporting capabilities complement the City's vehicle management software and should not be viewed as the only way to monitor the City's fuel usage. Therefore, because Fleet Services utilizes its internal reporting capabilities and that it is in communication with its peers, the City of Oxnard feels it does follow Best Practices for controlling and administering its fuel programs.

**FI-07.** Oxnard does not have tanks to store fuel for cost saving or as a means to have fuel available during shortages. (FA-04, 12-13)

The City of Oxnard does have fuel tanks at their fire stations and at the waste water treatment plant. These tanks are limited in size as they were meant to be a fuel source only for the equipment at those locations. There is language written into both of our contracts with fuel providers to continue to provide fuel through the use of tankers in the event of a fuel shortage/emergency.

**FI-08.** Oxnard and Simi have high-efficiency vehicles that are not attaining high mileage. (FA-12)

The City of Oxnard's Fleet Services Division advised that the two vehicles that were getting the lower mpg are used for traffic enforcement (parking tickets). These vehicles are involved in continual start and stop operation.

If I could be of further assistance, please don't hesitate to contact me at (805) 385-7624.

Sincerely,

Tim Flynn

Mayor

Cc: City Council

Karen R. Burnham, Interim City Manager Michael Henderson, General Services Superintendant